

# *Study on Influencing Factors of Wine Customer Loyalty in Ningxia and Its Brand Development Path*

Sun Yu<sup>1</sup>, Sun Qiong<sup>a,\*</sup>, Wang Zhongsheng

<sup>1</sup>Management College, Beijing Union University, Beijing, 100101, China

<sup>a</sup>sunqiongbuu@163.com

\*Corresponding author

**Keywords:** Ningxia producing area; Wine marketing; Customer loyalty; Brand development

**Abstract:** Based on 110 national questionnaire samples, based on the Swedish Customer Satisfaction Index (SCSB) model, 20 observation variables were designed from four dimensions: promotion perception, product experience, channel experience and customer loyalty to explore the factors affecting wine brand loyalty in Ningxia producing areas by SPSS. Research shows that promotion perception, product experience and channel experience have direct or indirect positive effects on customer loyalty. Finally, according to the research results, the development path of wine brands in Ningxia producing areas is explored.

## 1. Introduction

International experience shows that rural recession goes hand in hand with urbanization and modernization<sup>[1]</sup>. The sustainable development of rural areas has become an important issue of state governance in the new era<sup>[2]</sup>. In July, 2021, Ningxia National Comprehensive Experimental Zone for the Open Development of Grape and Wine Industry (hereinafter referred to as the Comprehensive Experimental Zone) was officially started with the approval of the State Council. The wine industry is a comprehensive format with high correlation and deep integration with planting, processing and tourism services. It has natural coupling with upstream and downstream industries and is an important carrier for the integrated development of the whole industry chain<sup>[3]</sup>, "small grapes" has become a "big industry" to revitalize the countryside<sup>[4]</sup>. China wine market is closely related to the world wine market, which causes Ningxia wine to be squeezed by internal and external troubles. On the one hand, it comes from the threats of price flooding, cultural infiltration and original wineries imported from the world, on the other hand, it comes from the challenges of peer competition, brand awareness and market segmentation brought by the rapid development of China wine market<sup>[5]</sup>. Ningxia wine enterprises want to continuously increase market share and seek development in the cracks. At the same time, they must strengthen their own product quality, increase cultural connotation, strengthen publicity and promotion, take building and consolidating brand loyalty as the fundamental goal of marketing activities, and improve added value and comprehensive benefits.<sup>[6]</sup>. Therefore, it is of great practical significance to explore the influencing factors of wine customer loyalty in Ningxia producing areas and seek its brand development path.

Previous research on wine marketing usually focused on the influence of product quality,

technology upgrading, sales channels or customer's buying behavior on wine sales. For example, Miomir M Jovanovic et al<sup>[7]</sup> By analyzing the interaction and individual influence of social demography and behavioral cognitive factors on the frequency and quality of wine consumption, this paper puts forward that consumers' income, education level and behavioral cognitive factors (such as price importance, place of purchase and product characteristics) have a dominant influence and brands and advertisements are important for choice. Gao Xiaoqin used factor analysis to quantitatively analyze consumers' purchasing psychology, and determined the main interests consumers pursued when buying wine<sup>[8]</sup>. Mu Weisong and others combed and analyzed the marketing model and characteristics of China's wine industry from a macro perspective, and put forward suggestions to improve and optimize the wine marketing system in combination with Ningxia's own characteristics and industry development environment<sup>[9]</sup>.

Based on the above traditional research, the research on wine marketing has the trend of promoting wine brand marketing from the consumer's buying behavior. First, researchers began to explore the influencing factors of wine customer satisfaction, mainly how cultural identity, marketing perception, product experience and functional experience affect customer satisfaction. Ji Junlin and others put forward that product experience directly affects brand loyalty, while cultural identity, marketing perception and functional experience all have direct and indirect effects on brand loyalty, and cultural identity is the most important factor affecting wine brand loyalty.<sup>[10]</sup> Second, the relationship between brand marketing and the image of origin has also become a research hotspot. Based on the theory of origin image, Julia and Hu Chaping put forward that the origin image of Ningxia significantly affects consumers' attitude and evaluation of Ningxia wine brands<sup>[11]</sup>.

The research of this paper is inspired by the above research, but it pays more attention to the research on the influencing factors of wine customer loyalty in Ningxia producing areas, and explores the relationship between product experience, promotion experience and channel experience and customer loyalty, which benefits from the marketing mix theory. In the past, the application of this theory was to influence the market demand from four dimensions: product strategy, price strategy, channel strategy and promotion strategy. In this paper, consumer perception was taken as the starting point, and the questionnaire was designed from three dimensions: product, promotion and channel, and its influence on wine brand loyalty was analyzed by SPSS, so as to contribute to enriching and perfecting the theoretical system of wine brand suggestion in Ningxia, and provide valuable reference for wine enterprises to strengthen brand marketing.

## **2. Research hypothesis and data analysis**

### **2.1 Research hypothesis**

The Swedish-Customer-Satisfaction-Barometer (SCSB) model is the earliest national customer satisfaction index model in the world, which points out that customer expectation and perceived performance are the main factors that affect customer satisfaction and thus make customers loyal. On this basis, combined with the characteristics of Ningxia wine products, this paper regards customer's promotion perception as the main expectation of customers, divides customer's perceived performance into two categories: product experience and channel experience, and sets promotion perception (PP), product experience (PE), channel experience (CE) and customer loyalty (CL) as four latent variables.

- H1: Consumers' perception of Ningxia wine promotion has a positive impact on customer loyalty;
- H2: Consumers' experience of Ningxia wine products has a positive impact on customer loyalty;
- H3: Consumers' channel experience of Ningxia wine has a positive impact on customer loyalty.

## 2.2 Questionnaire design and data collection

In this paper, customer loyalty is defined as: customers first have a good impression on Ningxia wine, and then upgrade to trust, dependence and other emotions. In this situation, customers are inclined to Ningxia wine when making purchase decisions, which will increase the probability of buying this brand frequently and give up buying other wines. According to assumptions H1~H3 and referring to existing research results<sup>[10,12]</sup> Four latent variables were set to analyze the influencing factors of wine brand loyalty and their internal relations. Each latent variable was set with 3-7 observation variables, totaling 20 observation variables, and its assignment was based on the 5-level Likert scale: 1 means complete negation, 2 means basic negation, 3 means general recognition, 4 means comparative recognition and 5 means very recognition. See Table 1 for specific items of latent variables and observed variables.

Table 1: Questionnaires and Variable Description

Latent variable	Symbols and items of observed variables	average/mean value	standard deviation
Product experience (PE)	PE1: Consumers' Perception and Recognition of Wine Color and Taste in Ningxia	3.864	0.903
	PE2: Consumers' Perception and Recognition of Wine Aroma and Quality in Ningxia	3.818	1.127
	PE3: Consumers' Perception and Evaluation of Wine Alcohol in Ningxia	3.909	0.863
	PE4: Consumers' Perception and Evaluation of Wine Appearance Design in Ningxia	3.855	0.897
	PE5: Consumers' Perception and Evaluation of Wine Price in Ningxia	3.818	0.950
	PE6: Consumers' Perception and Evaluation of Wine Distribution Service in Ningxia	3.964	0.928
	PE7: Consumers' Perception and Evaluation of Wine After-sales Service in Ningxia	3.927	0.916
Channel experience (EC)	CE1: Consumers' Perception and Evaluation of Wine Purchase in Ningxia	3.836	0.904
	CE2: Consumers' Perception and Willingness to Buy Wine from Ningxia in Large Supermarket	3.836	1.169
	CE3: Consumers' Perception and Willingness to Buy Ningxia Wine on E-commerce Platform	3.700	0.863
	CE4: Consumers' perception and willingness to buy wine in local wineries in Ningxia.	3.864	0.943
	CE5: Consumers' Perception and Willingness to Buy Wine in Ningxia through New Media Channels	3.773	0.864
Promotion perception (PP)	PP1: The frequency of consumers seeing wine advertisements in Ningxia in their lives.	3.800	0.886
	PP2: Consumers' Perception of Wine in Ningxia through New Media Channels	3.845	1.077
	PP3: Consumers' Perception of Wine Culture Experience Store in Ningxia	3.818	0.950
	PP4: Consumers' perception and willingness to participate in offline activities such as tasting meetings, trade fairs and promotion meetings of wine wineries in Ningxia.	3.736	0.925
	PP5: Consumers' perception of wine discounts, coupons, full discounts and other promotional activities in Ningxia.	3.855	0.975
Customer loyalty (CL)	CL1: Consumers' Willingness to Buy Wine in Ningxia	3.809	0.796
	CL2: Consumers' willingness to recommend wines from Ningxia to relatives and friends.	3.918	0.987
	CL3: Consumers' willingness to take Ningxia wine as their first choice to buy wine.	3.891	0.922

The object of this survey is people who have consumption experience or drinking experience of Ningxia wine. Due to the relatively large number of questionnaires, in order to ensure the authenticity of the collected data, this questionnaire adopts the online survey method-online questionnaire (Questionnaires). This questionnaire was distributed in the WeChat circle of friends, WeChat group chat, Weibo comments, Questionnaires and other channels, and a total of 113 questionnaires were distributed, and 113 were recovered, with an effective rate of 97.3%. Among them, the survey objects are distributed in Beijing, Fujian, Anhui, Jiangsu, Liaoning, Zhejiang, Hunan, Hebei, Sichuan, Shandong, Henan, Hainan, Guangdong, Liaoning, Jilin, Jiangxi, Inner Mongolia, Heilongjiang, Guizhou, Chongqing, Tianjin and other provinces and cities. The basic information characteristics of users are obtained, and the results are shown in Table 2. As can be seen from Table 2, the sample has the following characteristics: From the perspective of gender, the proportion of women among the respondents is much higher than that of men, accounting for 72% of women and 38% of men. In terms of age, most of the respondents are young and middle-aged. The people aged 26 -30 are the main group of wine consumers, accounting for 33%, followed by the people aged 21-25 and 36-40, accounting for 17%, while the people under 20 only account for 2%. From the professional point of view, clerks and related personnel are the most investigated, accounting for 25%. From the perspective of monthly income, there are more respondents with a monthly income of 7501-10000 yuan, accounting for 35%.

Table 2: User basic information feature

Characteristic	type	frequency	Percentage%
Gender	woman	72	65.5
	man	38	34.5
Age	20 years old and under	2	1.8
	21 -25 years old	17	15.5
	26 -30 years old	33	30.0
	31 -35 years old	14	12.7
	36 -40 years old	17	15.5
	41 -45 years old	15	13.6
	Over 45 years old	12	10.9
Occupation	Responsible persons of party organs, state organs, mass organizations, social organizations, enterprises and institutions	8	7.3
	All kinds of professional and technical personnel	6	5.5
	Office staff and related personnel	25	22.7
	Commercial staff	16	14.5
	Service staff	23	20.9
	Agriculture, forestry, animal husbandry and fishery workers	14	12.7
	Production work, transportation work and some manual workers	3	2.7
Other workers who are inconvenient to classify.	15	13.6	
Monthly income	2500 yuan and below	8	7.3
	2501-5000 yuan	14	12.7
	5001-7500 yuan	25	22.7
	7501-10000 yuan	35	31.8
	10001-30000 yuan	19	17.3
	30001-50000 yuan	3	2.7
	More than 50001 yuan	3	2.7
No income for the time being	3	2.7	

## 2.3 Data inspection

### 2.3.1 Reliability test

With the help of SPSS26.0 software, Cronbach's Alpha coefficient, an internal consistency index recognized by most scholars, is used to test the reliability, and the results are shown in Table 3. It can be seen from Table 3 that Cronbach's Alpha coefficients of the four latent variables are all greater than 0.75, which shows that the questionnaire has good reliability and high reliability.

Table 3: Reliability test results

Latent variable	Observed variable	Cronbach Alpha
Product experience	PE1,PE2,PE3,PE4,PE5,PE6,PE7	0.888
Channel experience	CE1,CE2,CE3,CE4,CE5	0.828
Promotion perception	PP1,PP2,PP3,PP4,PP5	0.838
Customer loyalty	CL1,CL2,CL3	0.767

### 2.3.2 Validity test

The values of Kaiser-Meyer-Olkin (KMO) and Bartlett sphere test P are selected as indicators to test the structural validity of the sample data, and the test results are shown in Table 4. As can be seen from Table 4, KMO values of the four latent variables are all > 0.7. The P values of Bartlett sphere test of four latent variables are all significant at the level of  $\alpha=1\%$ , which shows that the sample data structure is effective.

Table 4: Validity test result

project	Product experience	Channel experience	Promotion perception	Customer loyalty
KMO value	0.743	0.762	0.724	0.731
Bartlett sphere test (p value)	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.000

## 2.4 Correlation analysis and regression analysis

### 2.4.1 Correlation analysis

Table 5: Related Analysis Results

		Promotion experience	Channel experience	Product experience	User loyalty
Promotion perception	Pearson correlation	1	0.558**	0.595**	0.638**
	Sig. (double tail)		0.000	0.000	0.000
Channel experience	Pearson correlation	0.558**	1	0.551**	0.606**
	Sig. (double tail)	0.000		0.000	0.000
Product experience	Pearson correlation	0.595**	0.551**	1	0.592**
	Sig. (double tail)	0.000	0.000		0.000
customer loyalty	Pearson correlation	0.638**	0.606**	0.592**	1
	Sig. (double tail)	0.000	0.000	0.000	

\* \*. At the level of 0.05 (double tail), the correlation is significant.

Analyze the correlation between product experience, channel experience, promotion perception and customer loyalty, and the results are shown in Table 5. It can be seen that the correlation coefficient between promotion perception and customer loyalty is the highest, which is 0.638, and the significance test result (sig value) is 0.000, indicating that there is a very significant positive correlation between promotion experience and customer loyalty; The correlation coefficients between channel experience and product experience and customer loyalty are 0.606 and 0.592, respectively, and the significance test results (sig value) are both 0.000, indicating that there is a very significant

moderate correlation between channel experience and product experience.

### 2.4.2 Regression analysis

Regression analysis is made on product experience, channel experience, promotion perception and customer loyalty, and the results are shown in Table 6. It can be seen from the standardization coefficient that promotion perception has the greatest positive impact on customer loyalty, followed by channel experience. From the significance, we can see that product experience, channel experience and promotion perception all have significant positive effects on customer loyalty.

Table 6: Regression Results

model		Non-standardized coefficient		Standardization coefficient	T value	significance
		B	Standard error	Beta		
1	(constant)	0.553	0.311	-	1.779	0.078
	Product experience	0.236	0.090	0.231	2.626	0.010
	Channel experience	0.295	0.087	0.290	3.404	0.001
	Promotion perception	0.337	0.088	0.339	3.831	0.000

A. Dependent variable: customer loyalty

### 2.5 Research conclusion

Through the analysis of questionnaire data, three conclusions can be drawn. First of all, in terms of products, Ningxia wine producing areas should improve wine color and taste, wine quality, appearance design and formulate reasonable price range. Secondly, in terms of channels, the online sales channels in this producing area need to be strengthened. We should increase investment in online sales channels, speed up the construction of wine websites in Ningxia producing areas, strengthen cooperation with large-scale e-commerce platforms, open up online supermarkets, online stores and marketing areas for " East of Helan Mountains Wine", and expand exclusive online sales channels in producing areas. Finally, in terms of sales promotion, the producing area should strengthen the promotion of products and brands, expand the scope of advertising, and at the same time launch promotional activities such as full reduction and full delivery from time to time according to consumer demand to attract consumers.

### 3. Ningxia wine brand development path analysis

Regional brand, enterprise brand and product brand have the relationship of interdependence and coordinated development, so the healthy and sustainable development of brands should first proceed from the overall situation and realize the co-construction model of regional, enterprise and product brands. According to the analysis of the existing literature<sup>[13,14]</sup> Wine brands in Ningxia are regional brands, that is, public brands named after a certain geographical scope. If the brand can make consumers establish regional association, it can guide them to consume the brand, and then the brand effect of the regional brand will be produced smoothly. Regional brands have their distinctive characteristics, namely, regionality, external effects and industrial characteristics.<sup>[15]</sup> Specific to Ningxia grape brand, its regional performance lies in the fact that the brand has gathered the resources of many local wine enterprises and was established by various resource elements. At the same time, the enterprises and organizations in the region are the users of the brand, and the two complement each other. The external effect is that the wine brands in Ningxia producing areas can make consumers associate with the history, culture, function and emotion of the region, and establish consumers' loyalty to the regional brands, thus guiding consumption. At the same time, the brand must be recognized by consumers, so as to truly achieve brand reputation and promotion, and the two are

interdependent.<sup>[16]</sup> Regional brands have obvious industrial characteristics. Based on its unique high-quality grape industry, wine brands in Ningxia can have high recognition and reputation, which is the basis for the development of regional brands. The research shows that the relationship among regional brand, enterprise brand and product brand is complementary<sup>[17]</sup>. First of all, before Ningxia wine enterprise brand is formed, it is necessary to establish wine product brand. Product brand is the basic element in the whole brand system, and only through wine products can the brand value be embodied. The continuous growth of enterprises can effectively improve the competitiveness of regional brands. On the other hand, regional brand is the foundation and guarantee of enterprise and product brand, and the promotion of regional brand awareness can promote the market share and competitiveness of enterprises and products<sup>[18]</sup>. To realize the co-construction of regional brand, enterprise brand and product brand, it is necessary to establish brand management system, strengthen division of labor and cooperation among enterprises, improve industrial service system and improve industrial chain at the same time.

Establish a perfect brand management system. The government and industry associations and other institutions can jointly formulate industry norms and standards, improve the brand supervision and review mechanism, and formulate a strong regional brand protection system. Establish a unified industry standard, strictly screen and review the wine products in the region, and give the products that meet the standard the regional brand trademark, while the products that do not meet the industry standard will not enjoy the regional brand achievements. The regulatory authorities conduct irregular inspections with strong rewards and punishments to prevent enterprises from being mixed up. In addition to formulating unified industry standards, at the same time, by combining regional brands with intellectual property rights, relevant intellectual property protection laws and regulations are formulated and implemented to increase the cost and expense of abusing regional brands and improve the awareness and determination of enterprises to consciously safeguard the reputation of regional brands.

Establishing a complete wine industry chain is an important way for Ningxia wine industry to develop healthily and continuously and enhance its brand competitiveness. Facing the competitive pressure of imported wine, Ningxia wine can only reduce production costs, improve product quality and expand brand influence. Industrial agglomeration can effectively and reasonably allocate resources and save costs. Establish professional and standardized supporting service enterprises or institutions in the industrial center, and improve the professional service system of wine production, processing, packaging, warehousing, transportation, brand cultivation, advertising planning and marketing. Through these large-scale professional service systems with concentrated resources covering the whole region, not only can the cost of each link be reduced, but also more professional services can be provided through the competition mechanism of outsourcing service enterprises, thus effectively improving product quality and enterprise efficiency.

Encourage enterprises to cooperate in division of labor, promote the integration of the three industries, and realize the high standard, specialization and international upgrading of the wine industry. First of all, focus on building a number of fine wineries, cultivate well-known brands, comprehensively enhance the brand awareness and influence of Ningxia wine producing areas in domestic and foreign markets, and enhance the brand effect. In the process of brand building and cultivation, leading enterprises and boutique wineries should establish corporate image and brand example in establishing and maintaining regional brands. Small and medium-sized enterprises and small and medium-sized wineries tend to "hitchhike" and improve themselves and become bigger and stronger while enjoying the achievements of regional brands. Enterprises can share resources and cooperate in depth, form a new industry cluster with benign competition, and jointly create and maintain regional brands. The government and industry organizations can actively guide and encourage enterprises to cooperate and diversify, especially enterprises and wineries can complement

each other. Actively expand the types of products and services, unite with small and medium-sized enterprises, and increase various forms such as entertainment, sightseeing, farming experience, wine-making experience, wine tasting culture, leisure and vacation, so as to promote the integration of the three industries and the development of the whole wine industry chain. At present, under the opportunity of "The Belt and Road" Initiative in China, we can also establish a winery alliance to achieve a strong alliance of high quality and high standard, and work together to create a more professional and international world wine brand.

## Acknowledgement

This work was supported by the Project of Cultivation for young top-motch Talents of Beijing Municipal Institutions and the Innovation Center for Digital Business and Capital Development of Beijing Technology and Business University (SZSK202237).

## References

- [1] He Renwei. *Urban-rural integration and rural revitalization: theoretical discussion, mechanism explanation and realization path* [J]. *Geographical Research*, 2018, 37(11): 2127-2140.
- [2] Lin Lu, Ren Yisheng, Zhu Daocai, et al. *Research Framework and Prospect of Rural Tourism Guiding Rural Revitalization* [J]. *Geographical Research*, 2019, 38(1): 102-118.
- [3] Zhang Haizhou, Lin Lu, He Yanan. *Industrial chain tourism: concept connotation and case analysis* [J]. *World Geographic Research*, 2020, 29(5): 1006-1016.
- [4] Li Yuanyuan, Wang Luquan, Zhang Dong. *Analysis on the ways to enhance the competitiveness of China's wine industry* [J/OL]. *Grape and wine at home and abroad*, 2022 (3): 78-83. DOI: 10.13414/J.CNKI.ZWPP.2022.03.014.
- [5] Wang Linying. *Multi-dimensional integration of wine tourism in the eastern foot of Helan Mountain in Ningxia under the new regionalism paradigm* [J]. *Northern Horticulture*, 2016(23): 174-179.
- [6] Guang Defu, Li Bo, Huang Fei, et al. *Investigation report on the development of Italian wine industry* [J]. *World Agriculture*, 2022(12): 5-9.
- [7] Miomir M Jovanovic et al. *Decision tree analysis of wine consumers' preferences: evidence from an emerging market* [J]. *British Food Journal*, 2017, 119(6) : 1349-1361.
- [8] Gao Xiaoqin. *Analysis of China wine marketing strategy based on factor analysis* [J]. *China Business*, 2009, No.448 (07):4-5.
- [9] Mu Weisong, Feng Yumeng, Wu Xiaoqian, et al. *Analysis of wine marketing model and development suggestions in the eastern foothills of Helan Mountain in Ningxia* [J]. *China Brewing*, 2022,41(08):246-251.
- [10] Ji Junlin, Yang Yi, Chen Hongyao, et al. *Structural Equation Analysis of Influencing Factors of Wine Brand Loyalty-Taking Jiaodong as an Example* [J]. *China Brewing*, 2020, 39(5): 216-220.
- [11] Julia, Hu Chaping. *Research on the performance improvement of Ningxia wine brand: from the perspective of origin image theory* [J]. *Social sciences in ningxia*, 2018, No. 208 (02):94-98.
- [12] Zhu Zhenzhong, Li Xiaodan, Cheng Junmo. *Research on the formation mechanism of brand loyalty based on brand love* [J/OL]. *Foreign Economy and Management*, 2014,36 (11): 33-44.doi: 10.16538/j.cnki.fem.2014.11.005.
- [13] Yao Chunling. *Experience in building regional brands of French wine* [J]. *China Trademark*, 2015(3): 87-88.
- [14] Huang Liye. *Analysis of the main body and mechanism of regional brand building of agricultural products* [J]. *Research on Science and Technology Management*, 2008(5): 51-52+55.
- [15] Li Ting, Zheng Chuiyong. *Tripartite Game Analysis of Regional Brand Development of Industrial Clusters* [J/OL]. *Reform and Strategy*, 2015,31 (8): 130-133. DOI: 10.16331/J.CNKI.ISSN 1002-736x.2015.08.033.
- [16] Yang Hecai, Cheng Xiaobei. *Exploring wine marketing strategy from the perspective of wine culture* [J]. *China Brewing*, 2014, 33(12): 163-165.
- [17] Xiao Yan, Zhang Liqun. *Research on the development mechanism of regional brand economy* [J]. *social science front*, 2017(9): 251-255.
- [18] Xia Zengyu, Xie Jian. *Discussion on regional brand building-Wenzhou case study* [J/OL]. *China Industrial Economy*, 2003 (10): 43-48. DOI: 10.19581/J.CNKI.CIEJournal.2003.10.006.